

**TOWN OF GILBERT
DESIGN REVIEW BOARD REGULAR MEETING
50 E. CIVIC CENTER DRIVE, GILBERT, ARIZONA
DECEMBER 12, 2013**

BOARD PRESENT:

Chairman Bob Deardorff
Vice Chairman David Gibson
Board Member Brian Johns
Board Member Darrell Truitt
Board Member Benjamin Palmer
Board Member Wahid Alam
Alternate Jason Watson

BOARD ABSENT:

Board Member Brian Andersen

STAFF PRESENT:

Planning Manager Linda Edwards
Principal Planner Catherine Lorbeer
Senior Planner Al Ward
Senior Planner Maria Cadavid
Planner Amy Temes
Planner Nathan Williams

ALSO PRESENT:

Town Council Member Victor Peterson
Recorder Margo Fry

I N D E X

<u>PLANNER</u>	<u>CASE</u>	<u>PAGE</u>	<u>VOTE</u>
AMY TEMES	DR13-27	2	APPROVED
AL WARD	DR13-31	2	APPROVED
AL WARD	DR13-34	3	APPROVED
AL WARD	DR13-30	3	APPROVED
AL WARD	DR13-35	5	APPROVED
MARIA CADAVID	DR13-37	6	APPROVED

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Bob Deardorff called the meeting to order at 5:30 P.M.

ROLL CALL:

Ms. Fry called the roll and a quorum was determined to be present.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Chairman Bob Deardorff announced that if there were anyone in the audience who wished to speak on a case that there were comment cards located in the rear of the room that should be filled out and submitted to staff

Chairman Deardorff announced that there was someone from the public who wish to speak on item 8, DR13 – 30 so they would remove that item from the Consent Agenda and put it on the Non-consent Agenda. Item 9, DR13 – 31 and item 10, DR13 – 34 were moved to the Consent Agenda.

A motion was made by Vice Chairman David Gibson and seconded by Board Member Wahid Alam to approve the revised agenda.

Motion carried 7 - 0

COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS

Chairman Deardorff announced that at that time members of the public may comment on items not on the agenda. He stated that the Board's response was limited to responding to criticism, asking staff to review a matter commented upon or asking that the matter be put on a future agenda. He asked if there was anyone who would like comment on a matter that was not on the agenda.

No one came forward.

PUBLIC HEARING (CONSENT)

The following items are considered consent calendar items and may be approved by a single motion unless removed at the request of the Board for further discussion/action. Other items on the agenda may be added to the consent calendar and approved under the single motion.

Chairman Deardorff read the consent items.

DR13-27: AMERICAN ORCHARDS SENIOR CARE.

Approval of the findings of fact and approval of DR13-27, American Orchards: site plan, landscape, grading and drainage, elevations, lighting, colors and materials, located at the southeast corner of Lindsay and Guadalupe Roads zoned Single Family - 35 (SF-35) with a Planned Area Development (PAD) overlay, subject to conditions:

1. Construction of the project shall conform to the exhibits approved by the Design Review Board at the November 14, 2013 public hearing.
2. The construction site plan documents shall incorporate the Standard Commercial and Industrial Site Plan Notes adopted by the Design Review Board on March 11, 2004.
3. The sidewalks shown in the Landscape Plan shall be corrected to match the Site Plan at the time of construction document submittal.

DR13-31: RIVULON OFFICE BUILDING PHASE 1B: LOCATED EAST OF THE NORTHEAST CORNER OF GILBERT ROAD AND THE SANTAN FREEWAY

Approval of the findings of fact and approval of DR13-31 Rivulon 4-story Office Building, for site plan, grading and drainage, elevations, floor plans, lighting, colors and materials, located east of the northeast corner of Gilbert Rd. and Santan Freeway in Regional Commercial (RC) and Business Park (BP) Zoning District, subject to conditions;

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
12-12-13 REGULAR MEETING

1. Construction of the project shall conform to the exhibits approved by the Design Review Board at the December 12, 2013 public hearing.
2. Project shall be subject to the approval of case Z13-33 Rivulon, Planned Area Development by Town Council scheduled for Dec. 12, 2013.
3. The construction site plan documents shall incorporate the Standard Commercial and Industrial Site Plan Notes adopted by the Design Review Board on March 11, 2004.

DR13-34: RIVULON PHASE 1B STREETSCAPE AMENITIES FOR GILBERT ROAD AND RIVULON BOULEVARD: LOCATED EAST OF THE NORTHEAST CORNER OF GILBERT ROAD AND SANTAN FREEWAY.

Approval of the findings of fact and approval of DR13-34 Gilbert Road and Rivulon Boulevard Streetscape Amenities Phase 1b; for primary infrastructure, landscaping, grading and drainage, berming, sidewalks and improvements for the Rivulon site frontage and primary access, located at Gilbert Rd. and Santan Freeway in Regional Commercial (RC) and Business Park (BP) zoning districts, subject to the following conditions;

1. Construction of the project shall conform to the exhibits approved by the Design Review Board at the December 12, 2013 public hearing.
2. With final plans submittal the developer shall provide revised a Landscape Plan to provide 6 new trees along Gilbert Rd., on each side of the Rivulon Blvd. intersection with such trees being located within 50 ft. of the edge of the Gilbert Rd. right-of-way. In addition, with the revised Landscape Plan, the developer shall provide additional trees along Rivulon Blvd. to assure that the density of trees meets the Town of Gilbert requirement of 1 tree for each 25 ft. of street length, each side, with tree located within 50 ft. of the right-of-way.
3. With final plans submittal the developer shall provide revised plans showing a consistent right-of-way width and lane configuration for Rivulon Blvd, and revise the dimension of the traffic circle to assure outside and inside turning radius is met.
4. The construction site plan documents shall incorporate the Standard Commercial and Industrial Site Plan Notes adopted by the Design Review Board on March 11, 2004.

A motion was made by Board Member Wahid Alam and seconded by Board Member Brian Johns to approve the agenda as read.

Motion carried 7 – 0

Board Member Truitt declared a conflict of interest and abstained from the vote on DR13 – 31 and DR13 – 34.

PUBLIC HEARING (NON-CONSENT)

Comments will be heard from those in support of or in opposition to an item. Anyone wishing to speak during that time or regarding any of the items on the public hearing must fill out a yellow slip and bring it to the front of the room. Once the hearing is closed there will be no further public comment unless requested by a member of the Board.

DR13-30: HIGLEY PLAZA; LOCATED AT THE SOUTHWEST CORNER OF HIGLEY AND PECOS ROADS ZONED SHOPPING CENTER (SC) WITH PLANNED AREA DEVELOPMENT (PAD) OVERLAY.

Senior Planner Al Ward Displayed the Site Plan and noted that it was an approximately 13 acre site, full motion access at Willis Road on the Southeast corner and a full motion Road onto Pecos at the Northwest corner of the site. The rest of the access comes into Higley Manor which is a rapidly

developing residential area to the South and West. Planner Ward noted that there was 160 foot separation distance between the major anchor store and the nearest residential and 100 feet to Willis. There is a landscape buffer zone between the residences to the South and the site. Planner Ward displayed a revised site plan which was looked at in study session and one of the comments was that where Willis Road accesses the site there is a direct north-south primary access into the property immediately adjacent to the major. When you come in you are immediately facing a substantial wall which is 25/28 feet tall. The access way has been buffered and the applicant has provided a 20 foot separation distance along the East side of the major as well as modified the architecture. The 20 foot landscape area includes 15 feet in landscape planter and a 5 foot walkway. There is approximately 94,000 ft.² total. Shops A and B have their back to Higley and there are 3 pads to the North which are the Valero, McDonald's and potentially a bank at that location. Parking is sufficient as well as open space, etc. Planner Ward indicated the exhibit and noted that the landscape was 15 feet with an additional 5 foot sidewalk which was the revised plan, to push the major back somewhat to the West and provide additional separation between the North/South drive aisle and the major. The architecture has been embellished and the trees are located along the planter and some additional articulation has been provided along the East wall as well as along the South wall.

Board Member Truitt said that what he had in his packet was slightly different than what they were seeing in staff's presentation.

Planner Ward said that this was an ongoing collaboration with the staff and the neighbors and they have received revisions right up until the current meeting.

Board Member Truitt said that he believed that the changes meet the concerns that the Board had expressed about the South elevation at study session.

Chairman Deardorff invited the applicant to come forward.

Russ Pororske, the developer of the project came forward. Mr. Poroske stated that he was present at the DRB meeting and took careful notes because they wanted to be sensitive to the concerns of the DRB. He noted that they took great pains to add additional articulation to the elevations. There is also a screen wall which is masonry and iron with plantings. They listened to the DRB in terms of the types and nature of the plants that would go on the Eastern elevation. One of the points of care that they took in the overall design of the center was that the massing is towards the highest trafficked parts of the intersection. Valero is on the heaviest traffic corner and is facing retail. The shops are pressed against the Street or present an imposing structural view to any of the neighbors. And the exposure to the neighbors is one small shops building to the West of the major with no other retail that would be considered light intrusive or would have a large façade that would present an imposing structural view to any of the neighbors and their site lines. Mr. Pororske indicated the site map and noted that a particular access way was a two-month project with engineering/traffic from the Town who were concerned about taking stress off of an already stressed intersection. They believed that they have addressed that and the idea that the Town had in designing Wyatt Way to take traffic all the way through and across to the major streets to the North and West.

Simon Knight, Gilbert, AZ came forward. Mr. Knight said that he would like to know about the access from Higley Manor. He indicated the site map and asked if there was any pedestrian access from the left-hand side.

Planner Ward indicated where the sidewalk and access would be located.

Jim Hurley, Gilbert, AZ came forward. Mr. Hurley stated that he lived in Higley Manor as well and was hoping that there would be a nice side entrance into the area. He commented that his concern on the project was that on the Southeast corner at the Wyatt entrance it looked like a large curb with a lot of concrete. He asked if there would be any trees at that location. When shown the landscaping plan Mr. Hurley was satisfied that there would be adequate plantings at that location. He asked if there would be any check-cashing facilities in the vicinity.

Board Member Truitt commented that the Design Review Board did not get into land use and that they were the aesthetic cops.

Mr. Hurley said that he and his neighbors would love to see another food store complementary to the fries and that a health food store would be welcomed.

Chairman Deardorff closed the public hearing and asked if there were motion.

A motion was made by board member Darrell Truitt and seconded by Vice Chairman David Gibson to approve DR13 – 30.

Motion carried 7 – 0

Approval of the findings of fact and approval DR13-30 Higley Plaza, for site plan, landscape, grading and drainage, elevations, lighting, colors and materials, located at the southwest corner of Higley and Pecos Roads, in SC-Shopping Center PAD, subject to conditions;

1. Construction of the project and shall conform to the exhibits approved by the Design Review Board at the December 12, 2013 public hearing.
2. With final plans submittal, the developer shall provide a revised Grading and Drainage plan showing storm water basin depths are in compliance with LDC and Engineering Department requirements.
3. The construction site plan documents shall incorporate the Standard Commercial and Industrial Site Plan Notes adopted by the Design Review Boards on March 11, 2004.

DR13-35: CHILDREN'S LEARNING CENTER, LOCATED AT THE NORTHEAST CORNER OF POWER AND PECOS ROADS.

Senior planner Al Ward stated that the applicant had recently provided a new PowerPoint presentation with a revised landscape plan and elevations. At the study session in November, there were a number of suggestions that were provided on the development and design of the site. One of the key concerns was the base planting around the front of the building. The applicant has provided substantial base planting in the front, however, the classrooms for the children's learning center accesses directly onto a sidewalk abutting the building along the sides and rear of the building. There is then a 6 or 8 foot fence completely surrounding the site so that the children are completely contained within the fence. There is an exterior sidewalk that provides access from the parking area to the main entry of the building. Planner Ward indicated on the site map where the landscaping would be located. He noted that the retention at the rear has been made somewhat more organic. There was also discussion about the orientation of the ball fields and the applicant is open to direction on that issue. The Board commented that the rotunda was too prominent and out of scale with the rest of the building and as a center piece as a massive, glass structure with no other materials being used to distinguish it. The architectural treatment along the west side of the building has a better mix of materials beside the glass and some of those features should be used on the east (front) side of the building to give better detailing. Planner Ward stated that the architect had done a couple of things in response. They had asked for a canopy at the front which is actually a vestibule where it is a recess set into the rotunda glass so before you step into the main door you are already under the canopy of the rotunda itself. There is additional masonry immediately adjacent to the rotunda along the East and West side.

Chairman Deardorff invited the applicant to come forward.

Carl Frontera, VP of Development Services for Children's Learning Adventure came forward. Mr. Frontera said that one of their greatest concerns as an operator was the rotunda. The rotunda for them was a focal point, a brightly lit very dynamic area for parents coming into the building. He noted that the material that they use on the building is reflective. They have done their best to deal with the concerns in terms of the landscaping and adding masonry adjacent to the rotunda to soften the look.

Board Member Truitt asked the applicant if they had built this project before.

Mr. Frontera said that they were building it in Atlanta and Texas.

Vice Chairman Gibson said that it looked as though they were orienting the basketball court to the North/South and the volleyball court is still to the West. If they were playing on both courts at the same time the basketball could continue on beyond the court into the volleyball court.

Mr. Frontera said that they have internal netting that isolates the play areas. He noted that the playgrounds were primarily used during the day by younger children.

Chairman Deardorff commented that he had a comment card from Vanessa Shirley who was opposed to DR13-35 but did not wish to speak. Ms. Shirley's comment was that "the design is comparable to Tutor Time across the street and that child care centers in this neighborhood are excessive."

Chairman Deardorff closed the public hearing and asked if there was any discussion or a motion.

A motion was made by Board Member Darrell Truitt and seconded by Board Member Wahid Alam to approve DR 13 – 35 subject to the conditions in the staff report.

Motion carried 7-0

Approval of the findings of fact and approval of DR13-35 Children's Learning Center, for site plan, landscape, grading and drainage, elevations, floor plans, lighting, colors and materials for a pre-school/child care facility, located at the southwest corner of Power and Pecos Roads and zoned SC-Shopping Center with PAD overlay, subject to conditions:

1. Construction of the project shall conform to the exhibits approved by the Design Review Board at the December 12, 2013 public hearing.
2. The construction site plan documents shall incorporate the Standard Commercial and Industrial Site Plan Notes adopted by the Design Review Board on March 11, 2004.

DR13-37: CHRISTIAN BROTHERS AUTOMOTIVE – LOT 'F' LINDSAY SQUARE LOCATED EAST OF THE NORTHEAST CORNER OF LINDSAY AND WILLIAMS FIELD ROAD.

Senior Planner Maria Cadavid stated that DR13 – 37 was an infill plat in Lindsay Square. An aerial map was displayed and the uses surrounding the project site were pointed out. Ms. Cadavid noted that it was a Community Commercial piece that had been vacant for several years. Photos were displayed of the surrounding uses. The PAD site is 1.1 acres and the facility is 5068 ft.². All of the standards have been met and the applicant is willing to put additional potted plants in front of the office space. The applicant continues the same alignment of parking stalls and landscape islands as the rest of the existing improvements throughout the center. Also, the applicant has positioned the bay doors and the office space in a way that the latter screens the visibility of the large doors and the utilitarian activity of this use from the right-of-way view. Traffic Division recommends moving the east-west driveway that is located to the north of the building further south to facilitate turning movements with the rest of the center. Planner Cadavid displayed the landscaping plan and noted that the planting was very water conservative. There is a condition that needs to add the box sizes of the trees and work with the owner of the center to add to trees along Williams Field Road to meet the minimum tree quantity requirement. Planner Cadavid said that the applicant was very respectful of what exists on the site currently. They have been successful in the screening of the Bay doors. The applicant has oriented the building in a manner that the overhead service doors are not seen directly from the right-of-way. The west elevation where the overhead doors are located is finished with ornate piers every three (3) doors, and the overhead doors themselves offer elements of articulation such as windows, mullions and piers with varied materials. The applicant agrees to apply the accent color Dunn Edwards 'Boxwood' on the cornice of the office building to provide a more updated look to the palette already used in the rest of the center. The combined square footage of the two signs proposed is within the maximum allowance at approximately 154 square feet. They also appear to meet the sign code regarding placement.

Board Member Truitt indicated the site plan and asked what the little building was on the North elevation.

Planner Cadavid said that she believed it was the mechanical room.

Board Member Truitt said that they had a really large drive into he would like to see the building slid over 4 or 5 feet to have a better probability for success of the planting, particularly if they could get a few more trees in the area. In looking at the East elevation he felt that it could really benefit by some more vertical trees being placed there. He noted that he would like to screen the North elevation as well with some trees.

Chairman Deardorff said that it was actually a glorified oleander.

Board Member Truitt said that on the East elevation it would be so much nicer if the planter area was 10 or 12 feet with vertical trees that could have some canopy. Looking at the site plan that shows 35 feet for the drive and he would suggest a 30 foot drive and put the additional 5 ½ feet over in that six-foot planter.

Chairman Deardorff invited the applicant to come forward.

Kevin Bollinger, Bollinger Consulting, Inc. came forward. Mr. Bollinger commented that the little room north of the building was the compressor room which will also house the fire riser. In terms of the landscape strip to the East, the suggestion of decreasing the driveway by 4 or 5 feet and increasing the landscape buffer by the same distance and putting larger trees in that area is a great suggestion. They could also place additional trees in the area suggested by the Board Member.

Chairman Deardorff said that he would prefer to see it all on the East as they have enough on the West.

Board Member Deardorff said that he agreed.

Mr. Bollinger said that he would also welcome the suggestion for putting screen planting for the base of the doors.

Board Member Deardorff said that they were not looking for canopy trees there so much as more of something that is lower in scale as it is the first 12 to 14 feet that they are worried about, not 30 feet in the air.

Mr. Bollinger said that there was also a comment made about adding more punch to the building with perhaps an accent color to the corners. He said that he thought that was a great suggestion as well and they had just tried to blend into the development and the rest of the shopping center.

Chairman Deardorff asked if there was a motion.

A motion was made by Board Member Wahid Alam and seconded by Vice Chairman David Gibson to approve DR13-37 adding a stipulation that the landscape yard along the east elevation be widened 5 feet and more trees added and along the drive on the west property line and the north elevation more trees shall be added to enhance landscaping on 3 sides.

Motion carried 7 – 0

Approval of the findings of fact and approval of DR13-37, Christian Brothers Automotive on Lot F of Lindsay Square: final site plan, landscaping, grading and drainage, elevations, lighting and wall signs, located east of the northeast corner of Lindsay and Williams Field Road and zoned Community Commercial (CC) with a Planned Area Development (PAD) overlay, subject to the following conditions:

1. Construction of the project shall conform to the exhibits approved by the Design Review Board at the December 12, 2013 public meeting.
2. Prior to submittal of construction drawings, the applicant shall revise the site plan and submit revised information to the Planning staff addressing the following issues:

- a. In coordination with the Traffic Engineering division, relocate the northernmost east-west driveway that is located to the north of the building, further south to facilitate turning movement with the rest of the center.
- b. Submit a revised landscape plan to provide:
 1. Note regarding the container box size for the trees in the plant palette and illustrate the existing trees and parking islands that will remain.
 2. In coordination with the Property Owners' Association or owner of the center, replace two trees in the landscape easement along Williams Field Road to meet the minimum tree quantity requirement.
 3. Revised south elevation to reflect the color Dunn Edwards 'Boxwood' applied on the cornice of the office building.
3. Applicant shall obtain a sign permit prior to the installation of any type of signs: wall and monument signs.
4. The construction site plan documents shall incorporate the Standard Commercial and Industrial Site Plan Notes adopted by the Design Review Board on March 11, 2004.
5. **The landscape yard along the east elevation shall be widened 5 feet and more trees added and along the drive on the west property line and the north elevation more trees shall be added to enhance landscaping on 3 sides.**

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEM

Minutes – Consider approval of the minutes of the Study Session and Regular Meetings of November 14, 2013.

A motion was made by Board Member Darrell Truitt and seconded by Alternate Jason Watson to approve the minutes of the Study Session and Regular Meetings of November 14, 2013.

Motion carried 7 - 0

COMMUNICATIONS

Report from the Chairman and Members of the Board on current events.

No report was given.

Report from Council Liaison.

No report was given.

Report from Planning and Development Services Manager on current events.

Planning Manager Linda Edwards said that currently in the Council Chambers was Operation Welcome Home for a Lieutenant Commander. There was a hot air balloon race scheduled for December 14 – 16 which would be held outside on the Civic Center common area. The luminary tour at the Riparian will be held Friday, December 20. There were 109 Single Family Building Permits in November which compares to 26 in Chandler, 53 in Mesa and 75 in Phoenix.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Deardorff asked if there was a motion to adjourn.

A motion was made Vice Chairman David Gibson and seconded by Alternate Jason Watson to adjourn the meeting.

Motion carried 7- 0

Meeting adjourned at 6:25 p.m.

Chairman Bob Deardorff

ATTEST:

Recorder Margo Fry